The key to control of international crime may depend on cutting off the flow of illegal profits to criminal organizations. It is estimated that $300 billion of “dirty money” may be laundered each year, its origin and ownership obscured as it passes through financial institutions and across national boundaries in an effort to hide and protect it from law enforcement authorities. Criminal organizations, like legitimate businesses, enjoy a swift and nearly risk-free conduit for moving money between countries—wire transfer systems. Illicit wire transfers are easily hidden among the 700,000 mostly legitimate wire transfers that occur daily in the United States, moving well over $2 trillion.

OTA was asked by the Permanent Subcommittee on Investigations of the Senate Committee on Governmental Affairs to assess the proposed use of techniques derived from artificial intelligence research to monitor wire transfer traffic and recognize suspicious transfers. Fully automated computer screening of wire transfers was found to be virtually impossible for technical reasons. However, OTA analysts developed and evaluated a number of alternative configurations of technology that, combined with certain legal and institutional innovations, could greatly enhance the capability of law enforcement agencies to detect and prosecute money launderers seeking to exploit U.S. financial institutions and wire transfer systems. Although all of these proposed configurations entail some economic and social costs, including possible diminution of financial privacy, strategies are suggested for minimizing these costs while enhancing the potential usefulness of information technology in control of money laundering.

ROGER C. HERDMAN
Director
Advisory Panel

Eloy Garcia
Assistant Special Agent in Charge
Operational Commander

W. Douglas Johnson
Assistant Director
Division of Banking
Office of the Comptroller

Robert MacAllister
Vice President & Senior Associate Counsel
The Chase Manhattan Bank, N.A.

Bruce Porter
Associate Professor of Computer Science
University of Texas at Austin

Priscilla Regan
Assistant Professor
Department of Public & International Affairs
George Mason University

Joel Reidenberg
Associate Professor of Law
Fordham University School of Law

Robert Serino
Deputy Chief Counsel
Office of the Comptroller of the Currency
U.S. Department of the Treasury

John Stern
The Francis M. Hipp Building
College of Business Administration
University of South Carolina

David Vogt
Assistant Director
Financial Crimes Enforcement Network (FinCEN)

Sarah Welling
Professor of Law
College of Law
University of Kentucky

Note: OTA appreciates and is grateful for the valuable assistance and thoughtful critiques provided by the advisory panel members. The panel does not, however, necessarily approve, disapprove, or endorse this report. OTA assumes full responsibility for the report and the accuracy of its contents.
Project Staff

Peter D. Blair
Assistant Director, OTA
Industry, Commerce, and
International Security Division

Andrew W. Wyckoff
Program Director
Industry, Telecommunications,
and Commerce Program

Vary Coates,
Project Director

David Jensen
Analyst

Steven Bonorris
Analyst

ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF
Liz Emanuel
Office Administrator

Karry Fornshill
Secretary

Diane Jackson
Administrative Secretary

Karolyn St. Clair
PC Specialist

PUBLISHING STAFF
Mary Lou Higgs
Manager, Publishing Services

Chip Moore
Production Editor

Cheryl Davis
Electronic Publishing Specialist

Chris Onrubia
Senior Graphic Designer
Reviewers and Contributors

Joseph Alexander
New York Clearing House

Alfredo Arellano
Popular Bank of Florida

F. Robert Armentrout
Internal Revenue Service
Criminal Investigations Division

Jim Atchley
Atchley Systems, Inc.

Jack Blum
Lobel, Novins, Lamont & Frug

Al Brandenstein
CTAC
Office of National Drug Control Policy

Vincent Brannigan
University of Maryland, College Park
College of Engineering

Gail Brett
Fedwire
Division of Reserve Bank Operations and Payment Systems
Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System

Brian Bruh

John Byrne
American Bankers Association

Fred Cate
University of Indiana School of Law

Michael Corcoran
Citibank, N.A.

Frank Curren
Treasury Management Association

Michael D’Ambrosio
Citibank, N.A.

Kawika Daguio
American Bankers Association

Randall Davis
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Jim Dear
The MITRE Corporation

Michael Eid
FinCEN

John Falvey
Drug Enforcement Agency

Carl Felsenfeld
Fordham University School of Law

Richard Fischer
Morrison and Foerster

John Forbes
Office of the Special Agent in Charge
U.S. Customs Service

Areg Gharakhanian
National Command and Control Systems
The MITRE Corporation

Joyce Goletz
Chase Manhattan Bank, N.A.

Theodore Greenberg
Department of Justice

Edmond Gueguen
Citibank, N.A.

Richard Harms
The MITRE Corporation

Michael Harrington
The MITRE Corporation

Patrick Harrison
Naval Research Laboratory

Rayburn Hesse
Department of State

Michael Hodge
National Association of Attorneys General

Cameron Holmes
Attorney General’s Office
State of Arizona
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sara Jane Hughes</td>
<td>School of Law, Indiana University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles Intrigao</td>
<td>Alert Publications Partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Douglas Jeffrey</td>
<td>SWIFT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carl Jensen</td>
<td>Racketeering Records Analysis Unit, FBI Labs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeff Jordan</td>
<td>Office of Enforcement, U.S. Customs Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graham Jordi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomas Judd</td>
<td>National Association of Attorneys General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louis Kallas</td>
<td>Office of National Drug Control Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clifford Karchmer</td>
<td>Police Executive Research Forum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen Kroll</td>
<td>Financial Crimes Enforcement Network (FinCEN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert MacAllister</td>
<td>The Chase Manhattan Bank, N.A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gary Marx</td>
<td>Department of Sociology, University of Colorado</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John McDowell</td>
<td>Comptroller of the Currency, U.S. Department of the Treasury</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walter McGovern</td>
<td>The Chase Manhattan Bank, N.A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greg Meachem</td>
<td>Federal Bureau of Investigation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Morawski</td>
<td>The MITRE Corporation, Artificial Intelligence Technical Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Mott</td>
<td>Cognitive Systems, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howard Mulholland</td>
<td>Internal Revenue Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joseph Myers</td>
<td>Office of Legal Counsel, FinCEN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jose Ruben Pena</td>
<td>U.S. GAO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kevin Perkins</td>
<td>Federal Bureau of Investigation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gregory Piatetsky-Shapiro</td>
<td>GTE Laboratories, MS-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graham Pinner</td>
<td>Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre (AUSTRAC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zelford Platt</td>
<td>Washington Metropolitan Police Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gregory Polvere</td>
<td>Internal Revenue Service, Criminal Investigations Division</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomas Poplawski</td>
<td>The Chase Manhattan Bank, N.A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ronald Rice</td>
<td>Financial Crimes Enforcement Network, FinCEN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louise Roseman</td>
<td>Division of Reserve Bank, Operations and Payment Systems, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seymour Rosen</td>
<td>Citibank, N.A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Rosenberg</td>
<td>Office of Strategic Analysis, Financial Crimes Enforcement Network, FinCEN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Susan Sandler</td>
<td>Citibank, N.A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ernesto Savona</td>
<td>National Institute of Justice, University of Trento</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dan Schutzer</td>
<td>Citibank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ted Senator</td>
<td>Financial Crimes Enforcement Network (FinCEN), U.S. Department of the Treasury</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelos Simoudidis</td>
<td>IBM Research, Almaden Research Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Organization/Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Small</td>
<td>Division of Banking Supervision and Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steven Smith</td>
<td>Thinking Machines Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Sobel</td>
<td>EPIC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malcolm Sparrow</td>
<td>John F. Kennedy School of Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harvard University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dan Stepano</td>
<td>Office of the Comptroller of the Currency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Thomas</td>
<td>CHIPS, New York Clearing House</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Trubow</td>
<td>John Marshall Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viveca Ware</td>
<td>Independent Bankers Association of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Weber</td>
<td>Office of Enforcement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Customs Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roger Weiner</td>
<td>Financial Crimes Enforcement (FinCEN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Department of the Treasury</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alan Westin</td>
<td>Columbia University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Westling</td>
<td>The MITRE Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Artificial Intelligence Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christopher Westphal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steven Wisotsky</td>
<td>Independent Bankers Association of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nova University</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Workshop Participants

The Use of Wire Transfers For Money Laundering
June 21, 1994

John Byrne
General Counsel
American Bankers Association

Jim Dear
The MITRE Corporation

Carl Felsenfeld
Professor
Fordham University School of Law

Sara Jane Hughes
Professor
Indiana University School of Law

Charles Intrigio
Publisher
Alert Publications Partners

Jeff Jordan
Office of Enforcement
U.S. Customs Service

Clifford Karchmer
Associate Director
Police Executive Research Forum

Zelford Platt
Financial Division
Washington Metropolitan Police Department

Privacy and Confidentiality in Payment Systems
September 28, 1994

Vincent Brannigan
University of Maryland, College Park
College of Engineering
College Park, MD

John Byrne
General Counsel
American Bankers Association
Washington, DC

Frank Curren
Director, Government Relations and Standards
Treasury Management Association
Bethesda, MD

Stephen Kroll
Legal Counsel
FinCEN
Vienna, VA

Vicki Roberts
Treasurer
Centex Corporation
Dallas, TX

David Sobel
Legal Counsel
EPIC
Washington, DC

Dan Stepano
Assistant Director, Enforcement and Compliance Division
Office of the Comptroller of the Currency
Washington, DC

George Trubow
Director, Center for Informatics Law
John Marshall Law School
Chicago, IL

Steven Wisotsky
School of Law
Nova University
Fort Lauderdale, FL

Information Technologies for Analyzing Wire Transfers
September 29, 1994

Joseph Collins
Naval Research Laboratory
Washington, DC

Patrick Harrison
Naval Research Laboratory
Washington, DC

Joseph Kielman
Chief Scientist
Federal Bureau of Investigation
Washington, DC
Acronyms and Glossary of Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACH</td>
<td>Automated Clearing House</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARPA</td>
<td>Advanced Research Projects Agency (Department of Defense)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATM</td>
<td>Automated Teller Machine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUSTRAC</td>
<td>Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BATF</td>
<td>Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, and Firearms (Dept. of the Treasury)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCCI</td>
<td>Bank of Commerce and Credit International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSA</td>
<td>Bank Secrecy Act (Currency and Foreign Transaction Reporting Act)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHIPS</td>
<td>Clearing House for Interbank Payment Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIA</td>
<td>Central Intelligence Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CID</td>
<td>Criminal Investigations Division (of the Internal Revenue Service)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMIR</td>
<td>Currency or Monetary Instruments Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRF</td>
<td>Criminal Referral Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTR</td>
<td>Currency Transaction Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTRC</td>
<td>Currency Transaction Report-Casinos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCC</td>
<td>Detroit Computer Center (a facility of the Internal Revenue Service)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEA</td>
<td>Drug Enforcement Administration (Dept. of Justice)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECPA</td>
<td>Electronic Communications Privacy Act of 1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDDS</td>
<td>Electronic Data Delivery System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAIS</td>
<td>Financial Artificial Intelligence System (of FinCEN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATF</td>
<td>Financial Action Task Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FBAR</td>
<td>Foreign Bank Accounts Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FBI</td>
<td>Federal Bureau of Investigations (Dept. of Justice)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FinCEN</td>
<td>Financial Crimes Enforcement Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRS</td>
<td>Federal Reserve System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTR</td>
<td>(Australian) Financial Transactions Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIDTA</td>
<td>High Intensity Drug Trafficking Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRS</td>
<td>Internal Revenue Service (Dept. of Treasury)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAFIC</td>
<td>Multiagency Financial Investigations Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSA</td>
<td>National Security Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCC</td>
<td>Office of the Comptroller of the Currency (Dept. of the Treasury)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ONDCP</td>
<td>Office of National Drug Control Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFPA</td>
<td>Right to Financial Privacy Act of 1978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STR</td>
<td>Suspicious Transaction Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUA</td>
<td>Specified Unlawful Activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWIFT</td>
<td>Society for Worldwide Interbank Financial Telecommunication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRAQ</td>
<td>Transaction Reports Analysis Query System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCITRAL</td>
<td>United Nations Commission on International Trade Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USCS</td>
<td>United States Customs Service (Dept. of the Treasury)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GLOSSARY

Artificial intelligence: The subfield of computer science concerned with the concepts and methods of symbolic inference and symbolic knowledge representation by computers; the attempt to model aspects of human thought on computers.

Asset forfeiture: The legal taking of property by government, if it has been used in the commission of illegal acts or represents the proceeds of illegal transactions.

CHIPS: Clearing House for Interbank Payment Systems, a wire transfer system (see below) operated by the New York Clearing House.

Comity: the voluntary deference of U.S. courts to the legislation of other sovereigns

Computer matching: the linking of different computerized databases by unique identifiers

Cupo account: A specialized bank account, maintained by a company (often an export/import firm) in a foreign country, where it is allowed to receive and hold a specified quota (“cupo”) of U.S. dollars outside of existing currency regulations. May be misused by money launderers.

Data protection: similar to fair information practices, data protection principles seek to restore control over personal information held by others.

Encryption: Encoding of information to protect privacy or maintain secrecy.

Expert system: Knowledge-based systems or computer programs that process data in ways that emulate human experts.

Fair information practices: principles governing the collection, use, disclosure, retention, and disposal of personal information.

Fedwire: The wire transfer system (see below) operated by Federal Reserve Banks.

Front company: An operating business, otherwise or formerly legitimate, that serves as a cover for money laundering operations.

General warrant or subpoena: a Constitutionally prohibited non-specific judicial order.

Integration: See “money laundering.”

Layering: See “money laundering.”

Money laundering: Disguising the origin and ownership of money, often by placing it in a bank, moving it through multiple transactions, and finally mixing it with legitimate funds. These steps are known respectively as placing, layering, and integrating the money. In this report, “electronic money laundering” indicates that wire transfer of the funds constitutes one or more steps in the laundering process.

Offshore banking, or offshore financial center: Agglomerations of banks and other financial institutions outside of the jurisdictions of major centers of economic activity such as the United States, in order to avoid the regulations or tax regimes of the larger countries while serving the needs of their institutions and investors. The offshore financial centers offer various advantages such as bank secrecy, low or no tax on interest income, looser regulations, etc.

Payable-through account: A specialized bank account, maintained by a bank of one country in a bank of a foreign country for the convenience of the first bank’s customers, who are given signature authority to conduct transactions using the account. Often misused by money launderers, with or without the complicity of the bank maintaining the account.

Placement: See “money laundering.”

Profile: A set of descriptors that allows recognition or categorization of subjects.

Secondary use: manipulation and use of information beyond the purpose for which it was originally gathered.
Shell company: A corporation that exists only formally, incorporated as a cover for illegal operations such as money laundering.

Smurf: To divide large illicit bank deposits into several transactions, each under $10,000, so that they will not become the subject of a Currency Transaction Report, as required by the Bank Secrecy Act. Smurfing is more formally known as structuring (a deposit).

Structure (a deposit): See “smurf.”

Subpoena: compulsory process requiring the production of records or testimony; resistance to which may be punished by judicial proceedings.

Threshold account: A specialized bank account that allows funds to be automatically wire transferred to a specified location once deposits into the account have reached a specified amount. Used by corporations to periodically concentrate revenue from several subsidiaries; may be misused by money launderers.
Contents

1 Electronic Money Laundering  1
   Money Laundering—What Is It?  2
   “Placing” Dirty Money  3
   Layering: Strategies for Hiding Dirty Money  8
   The Global Underground Economy  10
   Professionalizing Money Laundering  12
   Nonbank Money Transmitters  15
   The Outlook  17

2 The Mechanisms of Wire Transfer  19
   Moving Money: Book Transfers and Electronic
   Transfers  19
   Uses and Users of Wire Transfers  20
   Money Center Banks: Gateways to Wire Transfer  23
   Retrievability of Wire Transfer Records  24
   Electronic Funds Transfer Systems: Digital Pipeline for
   Money  25
   New Wire Transfer Regulations  32

3 Money Laundering and Law
   Enforcement  35
   Laws and Regulations  35
   Federal Agencies’ Roles and Responsibilities  39
   State Law Enforcement  42
   The Financial Crimes Enforcement Network
   (FinCEN)  43
   Summary  48

4 Technologies for Detecting
   Money Laundering  51
   Basic Technologies  51
   Detecting Money Laundering  63
   Findings  74
5 Privacy and Confidentiality  75
Constitutional and Legislative Perspectives on Financial Privacy  79
The Privacy of the Individual and The Control of Crime  87
The Confidentiality Interest of the Corporation  92
Conclusions  99

6 International Issues  101
Access to International Wire Transfer Information  102
International Law Enforcement Efforts  111
The Struggle of Sovereigns  117
Conclusion  118

7 Conclusions and Policy Options  119
Money Laundering and the World Economy  120
What Would a Computerized Monitor Look For?  124
Designing Systems for Use by Law Enforcement  124
Privacy and Corporate Confidentiality  125
International Considerations  129
Technological Configurations  133
Options  136